

# HPAM – GP 4835 Human Resources Management for Health Care Organizations: Principles

# Spring 2022

#### Instructor Information

- Prof. Sarah Gurwitz
- Email: sarah.gurwitz@nyu.edu
- Office Hours are by appointment. Students are encouraged to e-mail faculty at any time.

#### **Course Information**

- Class Meeting Times: Tuesdays January 25, 2022 March 8, 2022
- Class Location: 12 Waverly Place, room L114

# **Course Description**

This is a 1.5 credit course, designed to study the essential role of human resource management within healthcare organizations. The degree to which healthcare organizations manage human resources will, to a great extent, determine the success of the organization. The course serves as a comprehensive foundation for those aspects of human resource planning, development and administration vital to the human resource manager, line managers, and senior leaders.

# **Course Learning Objectives**

Through the text readings, journal articles, case presentation and discussion, and student presentations students will acquire the ability to:

- Create executive decision-making strategies, as applied to human resources management
- 2. Establish organizational workforce plans, in alignment with organizational goals and objectives
- 3. Establish staff training and development programs, in alignment with organizational goals and objectives
- 4. Implement successful recruitment and retention processes
- 5. Evaluate workforce productivity

- Understand and value the strategic role of human resources management in a health care organization
- 7. Understand and value the role of human resources in effectively managing organizational transformation
- 8. Understand and value the impact of workforce diversity and globalization on health care

# **Learning Assessment**

Assignments, exams, and class participation in the course will assess progress against these competencies, and no student will receive a B or higher without demonstration of satisfactory progress towards mastery of each competency. Expected levels of competency are denoted below:

# Level of Competency

In addition, the level of competency expected to be achieved should be denoted, according to the following key:

- [1] = <u>Basic</u>: Foundational understanding of knowledge/skill/competency
- [2] = <u>Intermediate</u>: Student demonstrates greater depth of understanding of this knowledge/skill/competency and can use this ability to analyze a problem
- [3] = <u>Advanced</u>: Student demonstrates expertise in this knowledge/skill/competency and can use this ability to evaluate, judge, and synthesize information

# Learning Assessment Table

Program Competency	Corresponding Course Objectives	Corresponding Assignments	Expected Level of Competency
PC 01: Manage and lead people, teams, and organizations, including the ability to work effectively with diverse colleagues to build inclusive organizations.	CO 01	Team Presentation Project Live Session Participation Pre-Class Assignments	2
PC 02: Develop strategies and align organizational design to support and achieve an organization's mission and vision.	CO 02	Team Presentation Project Live Session Participation Pre-Class Assignments	3

		Literature Review	
PC 03: Apply knowledge about the social determinants of health and work collaboratively with leaders across sectors — including housing, education, transportation, and others — to reduce disparities and inequities and to promote population and community health.	CO 04	Live Session Participation Pre-Class Assignments	3
PC 04: Use data and evidence-based management practices to improve managerial decision-making and organizational performance, including efficiency, quality of care, patient engagement, and equitable access to services.	CO 01	Live Session Participation Pre-Class Assignments Literature Review	2
PC 05: Provide effective financial management for healthcare organizations, including effective use of accounting and budgeting practices.	CO 05	Team Presentation Project Live Session Participation	2
PC 06: Influence and respond to policies that promote the performance of the US healthcare system and healthcare organizations, based on understanding and analysis of the system's history, organization, and financing.	CO 07	Team Presentation Project  Live Session Participation  Literature Review	2
PC 07: Communicate effectively with diverse stakeholders using a variety of communication approaches.	CO 03	Team Presentation Project Live Session Participation Other Participation	3

PC 08: Develop and manage innovations to improve organizational performance and population health.	CO 06	Pre-Class Assignments	2
PC 09: Manage and behave legally and ethically in a complex, highly-regulated healthcare environment.	CO 08	Team Presentation Project Live Session Participation Other Participation	2

# **Evaluation Criteria & Grading – Course Grading**

Assignment	Grading Weight	Due
Assignment 1 – Team Presentation	35%	Presentation: Sessions 7
Assignment 2 – Individual Paper	35%	Due: Session 7
Pre-Class Assignments	15%	Ongoing
Class Participation	15%	Ongoing

# **Letter Grades**

Letter grades for the entire course will be assigned as follows:

Letter Grade	Points
Α	4.0 points
Α-	3.7 points
B+	3.3 points
В	3.0 points
B-	2.7 points
C+	2.3 points
С	2.0 points

C-	1.7 points	
F	0.0 points	

Student grades will be assigned according to the following criteria: • (A) Excellent: Exceptional work for a graduate student. Work at this level is unusually thorough, well-reasoned, creative, methodologically sophisticated, and well written. Work is of exceptional, professional quality.

- (A-) Very good: Very strong work for a graduate student. Work at this level shows signs of
  creativity, is thorough and well-reasoned, indicates strong understanding of appropriate
  methodological or analytical approaches, and meets professional standards.
- (B+) Good: Sound work for a graduate student; well-reasoned and thorough, methodologically sound. This is the graduate student grade that indicates the student has fully accomplished the basic objectives of the course.
- (B) Adequate: Competent work for a graduate student even though some weaknesses are
  evident. Demonstrates competency in the key course objectives but shows some
  indication that understanding of some important issues is less than complete.
   Methodological or analytical approaches used are adequate but student has not been
  thorough or has shown other weaknesses or limitations
- (B-) Borderline: Weak work for a graduate student; meets the minimal expectations for a
  graduate student in the course. Understanding of salient issues is somewhat incomplete.
  Methodological or analytical work performed in the course is minimally adequate. Overall
  performance, if consistent in graduate courses, would not suffice to sustain graduate
  status in "good standing."
- (C/-/+) Deficient: Inadequate work for a graduate student; does not meet the minimal
  expectations for a graduate student in the course. Work is inadequately developed or
  flawed by numerous errors and misunderstanding of important issues. Methodological or
  analytical work performed is weak and fails to demonstrate knowledge or technical
  competence expected of graduate students.
- (F) Fail: Work fails to meet even minimal expectations for course credit for a graduate student. Performance has been consistently weak in methodology and understanding, with serious limits in many areas. Weaknesses or limits are pervasive.

#### Course Resources

Course readings might include any of the following: textbooks, software, relevant reading materials, videos, etc.

Students are **required to purchase the resources below** that are not available for free on the "Readings" tab. To encourage affordability, you may identify the most cost-effective method for purchasing these items. Please make sure you are ordering the correct ISBN and edition when you purchase a textbook for the course.

#### Required Course Textbook

- Sampson & Fried: Human Resources in Healthcare: Managing for Success (5th ed.).
  - Chicago, IL: Health Administration Press, 2015. Ebook ISBN: 9781567937091.
    - Link to ebook version:
       <a href="https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874">https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874</a>

# **Major Course Assignments**

#### Team Assignment: Funding Request

- Students, working in teams, will develop and present, in class, a 10-minute presentation to a mock Medical Center Resource (Funding) committee. The teams represent a midsize (20-40 FTE) organizational unit in a large inner city Academic Medical Center. The Center's primary mission is to provide comprehensive health care services to a largely poor ethnically diverse population. The Center is facing financial challenges; your unit however has a need to expand to meet a growing demand for its services. Your request should address the following criteria: o The type of organizational unit, o The number, types and kinds of positions requested, o How is the request aligned to the organization's strategic goals?
  - How performance for this initiative will be evaluated,
  - Budget considerations, and
  - An analysis of the current staffing addressing why the need cannot be met through staff realignment, efficiencies, or system re-design
- Each team will provide a brief handout summarizing the request for class participants.

#### **EVALUATION CRITERIA & GRADING - ASSIGNMENT #1**

☑ Presentations will be scored on a scale of 1-3 (3= Excellent; 2.5-2.9= above average; 2.02.5= average; 1.0-1.9= below average; <1.0= not acceptable) on how well each of the criteria are addressed ○ The type of organizational unit, ○ The number, types and kinds
</p>

of positions requested,  $\circ$  How is the request aligned to the organization's strategic goals?

- o How performance will be evaluated, o Budget considerations, and
- An analysis of the current staffing, addressing why the need cannot be met through staff realignment, efficiencies or system re-design

#### Individual Assignment; Literature Review

#### Topics:

- Best practices to ensure support of healthcare providers in times of medical crisis
- Effectively Managing Telework teams
- Sustaining and engaging a diverse workforce
- Best practices for engaging a remote workforce
- Interviewing, selecting, and onboarding remote staff

Your paper may address the topic in general, or further narrow the focus of the review within that topic. For your selected topic, complete a 4/5-page (double-spaced, excluding references) literature review, citing references, discussing the state of evidence on the topic, identifying potential best practices and summarizing your findings and conclusions. From the references you cite, prepare an annotated bibliography on 8 – 10 of the most relevant articles. Discuss the strengths and weaknesses of each article and applicability to a management setting.

#### **Detailed Course Overview**

#### Module 1 – Course Introduction and Strategic Human Resource Management

Introduction to Module: Strategic Human Resource Management (SHRM) is the process of formulating HR strategies and implementation tactics that are aligned and reinforced to the organization's business strategies. We will discuss the major aspects of SHRM: HR planning/job analysis, Staffing, Performance management and compensation, Employee engagement, Diversity, Inclusion and belonging, Employee well-being and the need to apply all these skills in a comprehensive integrated manner within the legal constraints imposed by legislation, court decisions, and professional policies.

#### Topics

- Syllabus
- Assignments
- Grading
- Strategic Human Resources in healthcare organization
- Reading: 

   Sampson & Fried: Human resources management in healthcare: managing for success. 5th ed. Chicago, IL: Health Administration Press; Chapters 1, (<a href="https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874">https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874</a>)
- Assignment:

Consider how your current employer, or a recent employer, would perform against the six categories and practices of effective healthcare organizations (Figure 1.1 Human Resources in Healthcare: Managing for Success, pages 4-5). For this assignment, evaluate your employer's performance in all six HR categories in a post of no more than 500 words and submit your responses. (Grade: Pass/Fail)

- HR planning/job analysis
- Staffing
- Performance management and compensation
- Employee engagement
- Diversity, Inclusion and belonging
- Employee well-being For this assignment, evaluate your employer's performance in all six HR categories in a post of no more than 500 words and submit your responses.

#### Module 2 - Professional Staff & Workforce Planning

Introduction to Module: This module takes a closer look at the diverse occupations that constitute a healthcare organization, such as allied healthcare workers, paraprofessionals, and support staff. Ensuring credentials, licensure, and skills is a key aspect of human resource management in healthcare organizations. Determining the numbers, types, and kinds of staff needed for the organization is also a critical aspect of the overall management of the workforce

Topics

- o Healthcare Professionals/Credentialing
- Workforce Planning

#### Readings:

 Sampson & Fried: Human resources management in healthcare: managing for success. 5th ed. Chicago, IL: Health Administration Press; Chapters 3, 4 and 13 (<a href="https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874">https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874</a>)

#### In-class discussion

- With a widely diverse workforce in healthcare (diverse occupations, human diversity, cultural diversity) what are the challenges organizations face in ensuring an effective and widely diverse workforce is in place, or stated in another way—How do you ensure you have a workforce that has the right number of staff with the right skills in the present and the future to meet the patient's needs?
- Consider how the delivery of healthcare is changing; with healthcare providers not necessarily in a face-to-face session, how does this affect providing care? Specifically, how would the use of telemedicine for remote-site interpretation of diagnostic image xrays (by providers outside of the organization and maybe outside of the country) affect credentialing/privileging decisions? 
   Chapter 13, questions 6 and 7 (pages 440 Sampson & Fried)

#### Resources

 Developing an Effective Health Care Workforce Planning Model – Assessment Tool: AHA, AONE, ASHHRA



#### Module 3 – Job design & Recruitment

Introduction to Module - In Module 3 we will focus on specific jobs/positions in healthcare organizations. The importance of conducting a job analysis is to determine the knowledge, skills, and competencies needed by the individual positions and how understanding the needed competencies are essential to successful human resource management of the workforce. We will also explore the changing nature of healthcare jobs. Once positions have been established and analysis conducted, the next step is to develop a recruitment plan. We will explore the essential aspects of successful recruitment and the pros and cons of using social media. In addition, students will identify positions in their own organizations, conduct a job analysis, and use O\*Net OnLine to assess the position and create a recruitment plan for the position.

- Topics
- Job Design and Job Analysis
- Recruitment
- Readings

 Sampson & Fried: Human resources management in healthcare: managing for success.

5th ed. Chicago, IL: Health Administration Press; Chapters 6 and Chapter 7 pages 199 – 220. (<a href="https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874">https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874</a>)

#### Assignment

- Select a position in your organizations and review the current job description, along with any job analyses that may have been developed. (HR may actually have the job analysis.) Using the selected documents and job information from O\*Net (<a href="https://www.onetonline.org/">https://www.onetonline.org/</a>), identify 3-4 key competencies that you'd expect from applicants for the position starting on the very first day of the job. In other words, what should someone in this position be able to do on their very first day of work? Keep notes on your findings
- Outline 4–5 bullet points describing how you would recruit for this position, including where and how you advertise the position. Submit your response using the assignment link. Grade Pass/Fail

#### In-class discussion

- What would happen if a healthcare organization decided not to use job descriptions?
- Recruiting through the internet (and social media) what are the advantages and disadvantages? What are the risks?

#### Module 4 - Interview & Selection

Introduction to Module - In Module 4, we continue the discussion on individual positions. We will expand on successful recruitment strategies, candidate selection, and staff retention. Specifically, we will discuss best interviewing techniques, how to determine the best candidate, and, once selected, how to retain these employees. We will discuss the advantages and disadvantages of internal and external recruitment, various common selection tools, reference checking, and reasons why candidates accept offers

#### Topics

- Interviews and Selection
- Staff Retention

#### Readings:

 Sampson & Fried: Human resources management in healthcare: managing for success. 5th ed. Chicago, IL: Health Administration Press; Chapters 7 pages 220237and Chapter 8.

(https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874)

#### Assignment:

- Watch video "More than a Gut Feeling"
- Using the job description and analysis from O\*Net from Module 3, develop 3–5 appropriate behavior-based interview questions for candidates and a rating scale to assess their responses.

#### Resources

 The SHRM Behavioral Interview Guide provides a good reference for developing questions and rating scales

(https://www.shrm.org/LearningAndCareer/learning/Documents/Behavioral %20Interviewing%20Guide%20for%20Early%20Career%20Candidates.pdf) .

 High-Impact Interview Questions: 701 Behavior-Based Questions to Find the Right Person for Every Job, Second Edition By: Victoria A. Hoevemeyer. <a href="https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/detail.action?docID=243033">https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/detail.action?docID=243033</a>

#### In-class discussion

 Given equally qualified candidates one from internal recruitment and one from external recruitment how would you go about deciding which one to hire.
 For various reasons, some healthcare organizations are unable to pay market rates for certain positions. What advice would you give such an organization about possible recruitment and retention strategies.

#### Module 5 - Diversity, Inclusion and Belonging

Introduction to Module - This module explores the importance of diversity, inclusion and belonging to the success of a healthcare organization. Understanding the different dimensions and kinds of diversity, the value of a diverse organization and the business case for diversity and inclusion and the relationship between diversity strategy and an organization's mission, vision and values.

#### Topics

- Organizational Diversity
- Inclusion
- Belonging

#### Readings:

 Sampson & Fried: Human resources management in healthcare: managing for success. 5th ed. Chicago, IL: Health Administration Press; Chapters 5 (<a href="https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874">https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874</a>)

#### In-class discussion

o What is the most compelling business argument for diverse leadership teams?

#### Module 6 - Compensation, Performance, & Wellness

Introduction to Module - This module explores three distinct aspects of HR in healthcare: performance management, staff compensation, and staff development. While distinct, they are all related and central to the delivery of high-quality healthcare. One of the goals of HR management in healthcare is to foster high levels of performance and commitment from individuals and teams. Performance management refers to a set of tools and practices used for setting performance goals, measuring individual performance, and designing strategies to continue and sustain

improvement, as well as providing ongoing feedback. Performance appraisal is an often-used term that tends to limit the process to measurement only. We will also look at compensation and the complexities of total compensation in a healthcare organization. Finally, we will discuss employee wellness.

#### Topics

- Compensation
- Performance
- Wellness

#### Readings:

 Sampson & Fried: Human resources management in healthcare: managing for success. 5th ed. Chicago, IL: Health Administration Press; Chapters 9,10,16 (<a href="https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874">https://ebookcentral-proquest-com.proxy.library.nyu.edu/lib/nyulibrary-ebooks/reader.action?docID=6606874</a>)

#### Assignment

- O Non-Monetary Compensation: Although monetary compensation is an important part of retaining a high performing workforce, factors such as non-monetary compensation make a difference when an organization is unable to offer market rate salaries and must examine other ways to compete. Outline 5—6 bullet points describing types of non-monetary compensation that might entice an employee to work for a lower salary; explain why these would be seen as especially valuable in lieu of an increased salary.
- <u>Performance Management</u>: Providing performance feedback is a challenge for both supervisors, as well as employees. Think about the best feedback session you have been a part of (either giving feedback or receiving feedback); what made the session successful? Now think about a session that was not successful; why was it not successful, and what could have been done differently? Outline 3–4 bullets on what makes a successful feedback session good
- New Employee On-boarding: Research the best practices in on-boarding new staff.
   Outline 7–10 of the best ideas you find.

#### Module 7 – Team Presentation

Team Presentations

# **NYU LMS (Brightspace)**

All announcements, resources, and assignments will be delivered through the NYU LMS (Brightspace) site. The instructor may modify assignments, due dates, or other aspects of the course throughout the term. Notification of such modifications will be provided as soon as possible through the Announcements tool on the course website.

# **Academic Integrity**

Academic integrity is a vital component of New York University and New York University's Robert F. Wagner Graduate School of Public Service. All students enrolled in this class are required to read and abide by *NYU Wagner's Academic Code*. All Wagner students have already read and signed the *NYU Wagner Academic Oath*. Plagiarism of any form will not be tolerated, and

students in this class are expected to report violations to the instructor. Any student in this class who is unsure about course expectations or how to abide by the academic code, should immediately consult the instructor.

# Henry and Lucy Moses Center for Students with Disabilities at NYU

Academic accommodations are available for students with disabilities. Please visit the *Moses Center for Students with Disabilities* (CSD) website and click on the *Reasonable Accommodations and How to Register* tab or call or email CSD at (212-998-4980 or mosescsd@nyu.edu) for information. Students who are requesting academic accommodations are strongly advised to reach out to the Moses Center as early as possible in the semester for assistance.

# NYU's Calendar Policy on Religious Holidays

*NYU's Calendar Policy on Religious Holidays* states that members of any religious group may, without penalty, absent themselves from classes when required in compliance with their religious obligations. Please notify your instructor in advance of religious holidays that coincide with assignment due dates or exams to arrange mutually acceptable alternatives.

# **Class Policies**

#### Attendance

You are required to attend all live sessions. Any absence must be explained and justified beforehand, or your participation grade will be lowered.

#### Late Assignments

Extensions will be granted only in case of an emergency, out of respect for those who abide by deadlines despite hectic schedules. Late submissions without prior permission will be penalized by  $\frac{1}{2}$  a letter grade per day (e.g., B+ to B).

#### **Grading Cube for Major Assignments**

#### Assignment: Team Project: Funding Request

Students, working in teams, will develop and present, in class, a 10-minute presentation to a mock Medical Center Resource (Funding) committee. The teams represent a mid-size (20-40 FTE) organizational unit in a large inner city Academic Medical Center. The Center's primary mission is to provide comprehensive health care services to a largely poor ethnically diverse population. The Center is facing financial challenges; your unit however has a need to expand to meet a growing demand for its services. Your request should address the following criteria:

Team Project Grading Cube			
Criteria	3 - Excellent; 2.5-2.9 above average presentation	2.0-2.5 - fully successful presentation	1.0-1.9 - below average presentation
Within 10 minutes	Presentation was within/under the time allotted	Presentation was within the 10 minutes allotted	Presentation was longer than 10 minutes
Presentation was clear, concise, flowed well, questions were answered	Presentation was clear, flowed well and addressed all criteria in a clear concise manner Anticipated questions	Presentation was good, addressed most criteria Answered questions	Presentation was not clear Questions were not fully addressed
Slides were well designed and organized	Slides enhanced the presentation, were well designed and well organized	Slides were clear and somewhat organized	Slides had issues. i.e. color, too much information, not well designed, organization
Addressed the type of organizational unit	Size of organization was very clear and understandable	Size of the organization was addressed	Size of the organization was not fully addressed
Identified the number, types and kinds of positions requested	The number, type and kind of positions requested were very clear and understandable	Number, type and kind were noted in the presentation	Number, type and kind were not fully addressed
Described how the request is aligned to the organization's strategic goals	Made a clear alignment to the mission and strategic goals of the organization	Mention the strategic goals of the organization	Did not address the strategic goals or mission of the organization
Described how performance for this initiative will be evaluated	Outlined a clear description as to how they would evaluate the initiative and how it would address failure to meet the expectations	Addressed how they would evaluate the initiative	Did not address how they would evaluate the initiative
Showed how the current staffing addressing why the need cannot be met through staff realignment, efficiencies or system re-design	Cleared demonstrated how the current staff could not meet the needs.	Demonstrated how the current staff could not meet the needs.	Did not address how the current staff could not meet the needs.

Provided a handout to	Handout enhanced the	Provided a handout	Did not provide a
the class	presentation		handout

# Assignment: Literature Review

Select a Human Capital topic, i.e.

- Best practices to ensure support of healthcare providers in times of medical crisis
- Effectively Managing Telework teams
- Sustaining and engaging a diverse workforce
- Best practices for engaging a remote workforce
- o Interviewing, selecting, and onboarding remote staff
- o Or a topic of your choosing, approved by the Professor

Your paper may address the topic in general, or further narrow the focus of the review within that topic. For your selected topic, complete a 4/5-page (double-spaced, excluding references) literature review, citing references, discussing the state of evidence on the topic, identifying potential best practices and summarizing your findings and conclusions. From the references you cite, prepare an annotated bibliography on 8 – 10 of the most relevant articles. Discuss the strengths and weaknesses of each article and applicability to a management setting.

Literature Review - Grading Cube				
Criteria	3 - Excellent; 2.52.9 above average presentation	2.0-2.5 - fully successful presentation	1.0-1.9 - below average presentation	
Paper was 4/5 pages	Paper fully addressed the topic in the allotted pages	Paper far exceeds or fails to meet the required page	Paper fails to meet the page allocation	
Evidence of careful review of relevant literature	It is exceeding clear that the topic was carefully reviewed	The topic is clearly reviewed	The paper lacks evidence that there was careful review of the topic	
Includes of relevant evidence and best practices, and gaps in evidence	Paper addressed best practices and any gaps found in the literature review	Address best practices and or gaps, but not both	Paper does not fully address best practices and or gaps in the evidence	
conclusions are supported by the cited literature	Conclusions are clearly supported by the cited references	There are conclusions but not fully linked to the references	Conclusions are not clearly identified	
Included a complete annotated bibliography of 8-10 of the most relevant references	A complete annotated bibliography is included that addresses both the strengths and weaknesses of the reference	Bibliography is less than 8 references Does not address both strengths and weaknesses	Bibliography is less than 8 references Does not address either strength or weakness	

Included a complete annotated bibliography of 8- 10 of the most relevant references	A complete annotated bibliography is included that addresses both the strengths and weaknesses of the reference weaknesses of the reference	Bibliography is less than 8 references  Does not address both strengths and weaknesses	Bibliography is less than 8 references  Does not address either strength or weakness
The paper organized and clearly written	The organization and style enhance the paper	Paper is well written and or organized but not both	Not well written and organized