Instructor Information

- Sarah Gerecke, Adjunct Professor of Urban Planning
  - ssgerecke@yahoo.com
  - (646) 591-3612
- Jerry Salama, Adjunct Professor of Law
  - jerry.salama@nyu.edu
  - (212) 280-3534 x3
- Eliza Ezrapour, Teaching Assistant
  - efe225@nyu.edu
  - (718) 514-5124

Course Information

- Class Meeting Times: Tuesday (4:25 – 6:25)
- Class Location: Furman Hall, Room 310

Course Description

This interdisciplinary seminar brings together law, urban planning and public policy students to analyze historic and current trends in affordable housing, community development, land use and housing finance. We use New York City as a laboratory that is both unique from, and similar to, other American cities.

The first three classes lay the foundation for the course. Class 1 provides data to determine whether New York City is exceptional…or not. It also explores the history of public and private racial discrimination in cities, and the tension between policies that support individuals and policies that support places. Classes 2 and 3 review the historical underpinnings of city growth and decline, the definition of the community, the role of prominent personalities in shaping New York City, and Federal housing interventions.
Classes 4 – 7 explore the financial and regulatory systems that shape urban housing and community development in New York City. In Class 4, we will learn about the history of affordable housing programs leading to the current challenges. In order to learn how to address those challenges, in Class 5, we explore project level housing finance as limited by macro housing finance systems. In both Classes 5 and 6, we understand the discriminatory impact of these systems and of the market. This necessarily leads to an exploration of segregation and gentrification. In continuing the analysis of regulatory systems that affect affordable housing development, in Class 7 we will learn about environmental regulation and land use regulation.

In Class 8, we learn about zoning (and inclusionary zoning) as tools to increase housing and to distribute “undesirable land uses” across the city. We apply the lessons of these prior classes to two scenarios in Classes 9 and 10: economic development and the hardest to house. Class 11 then brings all of the in-class learnings together through one case study project that gives us the opportunity to understand community, racial and economic segregation, environmental impact, zoning, economic development and neighborhood change.

We will have a field trip to Harlem and the Bronx on Friday, November 11, from 8:30-2:00pm to see some of the projects we learned about in class and to meet with community stakeholders.

The final two classes consist of presentation of the group papers. Each group paper topic has been selected to complement the in-class readings and discussion so that by the end of the semester you will have both a broad and deep understanding of Housing, Land Use and Community Development in New York City.

**Required Readings**

Readings for the class are listed below. One book (Jackson, *Crabgrass Frontier: The Suburbanization of the United States* (1985) can be purchased at the NYU Bookstore, or a free online version can be accessed through the [NYU Library website](https://library.nyu.edu).

Aside from *Crabgrass*, the remaining course materials are either available

1) on NYU Brightspace (NYUB) under the “Assignments” tab organized in folders by class date;
2) where URLs are provided below, directly from the internet; or
3) through the NYU Library website at [https://library.nyu.edu](https://library.nyu.edu).

The library readings can be accessed by entering the journal title, selecting one of the databases from the list provided and by searching within the correct year and volume of the journal. To access articles through the NYU Library website from off-campus computers, you will need to enter your NYU NetID and password.

For many assignments, we have created edited excerpts available on NYU Brightspace. The syllabus includes the link to the full article but students need only read the excerpted sections.
Overview of the Semester

Tues. 8/30 WEEK 1: Introductions; Course Framework and Recurring Themes; Overview of New York City
  ● Last day to drop class (by midnight)

Fri. 9/2 Submit Paper Topic Preference Sheet to jerry.salama@nyu.edu before noon on 9/2. Paper Topics will be assigned by e-mail on or before 9/5. Group members should begin contacting each other immediately.

Tues. 9/6 WEEK 2: Causes and Consequences of Public Intervention In New York City

Tues. 9/13 WEEK 3: The History of Federal Housing Policy and Grassroots Community Development

Thurs. 9/15 Electronic submission of outlines to professors and TA by noon. Sample outline uploaded on NYU Brightspace.

Tues. 9/20 WEEK 4: New York City Low-Income Housing Policies and Programs
  ● Student Presentations of Projects

Fri. 9/23 Submit revised outlines electronically to professors and TA by 12 noon.

Tues. 9/27 WEEK 5: Understanding Project-Level Housing Finance and the Impact of U.S. Housing Finance Systems
  ● Financial exercise will be available on NYU Brightspace.

Tues. 10/04 Class Canceled for Yom Kippur

Fri. 10/07 (Makeup Class) Time: 2:30-4:30  Room: Furman 310
WEEK 6: Discrimination, Gentrification and Displacement
  ● Financial exercise due. Bring two copies to class.

Tues. 10/11 WEEK 7: Environmental and Land Use Review Processes of Housing and Economic Development Projects

Wed. 10/12 Submit First Drafts of Paper by 9 a.m. (electronically)

Tues. 10/18 WEEK 8: Zoning, Inclusionary Zoning and Siting of Affordable Housing and Locally-Undesirable Land Uses (LULU’s)

Tues. 10/25 WEEK 9: Economic and Community Development Policies and Strategies

Tues 11/01 WEEK 10: Approaches to Housing the Hardest to House
Tues. 11/08  Class Canceled for Election Day

Tues. 11/15  WEEK 11: Affordable Housing Case Study Atlantic Yards

Tues. 11/15  Papers for 11/22 presentations are due at 9 a.m. on 11/15. Submit electronically to all faculty and students.

Fri. 11/18  Field Trip (8:30 a.m. - 2:00 p.m.)

Wed. 11/22  WEEK 12: Student Presentation of Final Papers

Tues. 11/22  Papers for 11/29 presentations are due at 9 a.m. on 11/22. Submit electronically to all faculty and students.

Mon. 11/29  WEEK 13: Student Presentation of Final Papers, continued
Detailed Course Overview

WEEK 1: Introductions; Course Framework and Recurring Themes; Overview of New York City

- Tuesday, August 30th
- **Topics**: New York City Today (demographics and background); Framework for Assessing Policy Needs and Opportunities in New York City; Targeting People versus Place; Neighborhood Change and its Effects on Race and Class

Readings


State of New York City’s Housing and Neighborhoods in 2021, NYU Furman Center (May 2022)
- Geography of New Housing Development: Introduction and Findings
- Citywide Data: [https://furmancenter.org/stateofthecity/view/citywide-data](https://furmancenter.org/stateofthecity/view/citywide-data)


Discussion Questions for Week 1

1. Based on the data on New York City from the Furman Center, how is NYC similar to and different from other cities or from the United States as a whole? Which statistics surprised you?
2. Is the NYC housing market a free market? What elements make up the supply of and demand for housing? What other factors might influence the housing market?
3. How did local governments create and maintain racial segregation?
4. What are the arguments for helping people versus helping places? Should Congress spend $18 billion to rebuild Puerto Rico, or write a check to each family affected by the hurricanes?
Important Dates
Friday 9/2: Submit Paper Topic Preference Sheet to jerry.salama@nyu.edu before noon. Paper Topics will be assigned by e-mail on or before Monday 9/5. Group members should begin contacting each other immediately.

WEEK 2: Causes and Consequences of Public Intervention In New York City

- Tuesday, September 6th
- **Topics:** Vision and Impact of Robert Moses and Jane Jacobs on Urban Development; The Mayor’s Role; The Urban History of Development in New York City and the Impact of Exogenous Factors of Suburbanization.

Readings


NOTE: If you have read any of the above before, feel free to skim these sections before class.

Discussion Questions
1. Why do cities (and New York City, in particular) exist in the first place? What are the forces that shape their growth and decline? What role did public actions and private market forces play in urban development? And, how did those forces work to create suburbs at the expense of cities?
2. Why should we have a policy about housing and community development at all? How much of the urban landscape today is the result of intended consequences of federal housing policies, and how significant are the unintended consequences?
3. What were the goals of the Cross-Bronx Expressway project? What constituencies were affected by the decision to build the expressway?
4. Why was Robert Moses a force for good in New York City? What are the flaws in Jane Jacobs’ vision of NYC?

WEEK 3: The History of Federal Housing Policy and Grassroots Community Development

- Tuesday, September 13th
- **Topics:** Federal Housing Policy and Subsidy Programs; Public Housing; The Evolution and Attributes of Nonprofit Housing Organizations.
**Readings**


HUD Fact Sheet on Public Housing, [https://www.hud.gov/topics/rental_assistance/phprog](https://www.hud.gov/topics/rental_assistance/phprog).


HUD Fact Sheet on CDBG, [https://files.hudexchange.info/resources/documents/About-the-CDBG-Program.pdf](https://files.hudexchange.info/resources/documents/About-the-CDBG-Program.pdf).


**Discussion Questions**

1. What is the rationale for the involvement of the federal government (as opposed to any other level of government) in affordable housing and community development?
2. What are the benefits and disadvantages of using community development corporations to implement housing policy? Public Housing Agencies?
3. Which housing programs are targeted to increase the supply of housing? Which attempt to influence the demand for housing? Which programs subsidize the cost of the physical plant, and which subsidize the cost of operating affordable housing?
4. How significant is urban policy (and housing policy) to the federal policy agenda today? What would it take to make housing a priority for federal dollars?

**Important Dates**

Thursday 9/15: Electronic submission of outlines to professors and TA by 12 noon. Sample outline uploaded on NYUB.

**WEEK 4: New York City Low-Income Housing Policies and Programs**

- **Tuesday, September 20th**
- **Topics: New York City History; NYC Housing Program Structures; Current Challenges and Approaches to Housing Programs.**
• Student Presentations of Projects—Class presentations will be 10 minutes per group. Students will comment on NYU Brightspace on each group’s presentation with research leads and scope suggestions.

Readings


Optional Readings

Discussion Questions
1. What were the causes of the housing crisis in NYC starting in the 1970’s all the way through the 1990’s? What are the causes of the housing crisis today?
2. What is the rationale for the involvement of local government specifically (as opposed to the federal government as we discussed last week) in affordable housing?
3. Aside from choosing between supply and demand subsidies, what other factors should New York City use in designing housing programs, both back in 1986 when they were first started and today?
4. In what ways are the design and structure of New York local housing programs unique or replicable in other cities such as Detroit and Newark?

Important Dates
Friday 9/23: Email Revised Outlines electronically to professors and TA by 12 noon.
Tuesday 10/04: Class canceled for Yom Kippur.

WEEK 5: Understanding Project-Level Housing Finance and the Impact of U.S. Housing Finance Systems
• Tuesday, September 27th
• Topics: Project Pro Formas; Development Budgets; Income/Expense; Public Subsidies; The U.S. Residential Mortgage Finance System and Neighborhood Impacts; Racial Segregation, Income Inequality and the Minority Homeownership Gap as a result of the Macro Finance System
• The Financial Exercise will be available on NYU Brightspace today. It is due in class on Friday 10/07. PLEASE DO THE EXERCISE INDIVIDUALLY—DO NOT CONSULT ANYONE OTHER THAN FACULTY OR THE TA FOR THE EXERCISE.
Readings

Financial Exercise Assignment: Please read the assignment in conjunction with the first readings on the syllabus. The submission is not due until Friday, October 7th.


(Optional) Bungalow, Edited Pro forma in real estate and how to calculate (2022)


Discussion Questions

1. What factors would you consider as a borrower or lender for financing an affordable housing project?
2. Why is there a separate system of construction financing versus permanent financing?
3. What aspects of the US housing finance system resulted in segregated neighborhoods and inequality of wealth by race and ethnicity?
4. What are the consequences of racial and economic segregation in New York City?

Important Dates

October 4: Class Cancelled for Yom Kippur

WEEK 6: Discrimination, Gentrification and Displacement

- Friday, October 7th (Makeup Class)
- **Topics:** Discrimination, Gentrification and Displacement—Causes, Consequences and Cures
- **FINANCIAL EXERCISE DUE TODAY.** Bring one printed copy of your answer to the financial exercise to class for joint review and one printed copy to submit to the Professor.
Readings

MHANY Management, Inc. v. County of Nassau, 819 F.3d 581 (2d Cir. 2016) (edited excerpt on NYU Brightspace).


There Went the Neighborhood podcast Season 1, (2016) https://www.wnycstudios.org/podcasts/neighborhood/episodes/episode-9-debrief


Discussion Questions
1. How did de jure and de facto discrimination express itself in MHANY?
2. What is the role that personal and market preference play in residential segregation in NYC?
3. Is it ever appropriate to include “neighborhood character” in policy decisions?
4. What is the harm of gentrification? What are the benefits?
5. What is the remedy for the harms of segregation? For gentrification?

WEEK 7: Environmental and Land Use Review Processes of Housing and Economic Development Projects

- Tuesday, October 11th
- **Topics:** City Environmental Quality Review (CEQR) Process and Uniform Land Use Review Process (ULURP) of Housing and Economic Development Projects.

Readings


SEQRA Excerpts (on NYU Brightspace):
1. Article 78, NYS Civil Practice Law and Rules.


NYC Land Use Excerpts (on NYU Brightspace):
1. Article 20, NYS General City Law.
2. Outline Summarizing New York City Charter, Section 197-c.

**Discussion Questions**

1. Imagine that you are a developer (non-profit or for-profit). Prior to proceeding to the environmental or land use review processes, what other types of analyses must you perform in order to develop a new housing or community development project?
2. What triggers an environmental review under SEQRA (or CEQR) and is the definition of the term “environment” in the SEQRA regulations, as applied by the Chinatown Staff and Workers court, intuitive?
3. Under the SEQRA regulations, what are the potential types of “outcomes” of the environmental review of a proposed project and what are the potential “findings”? Must an agency or developer abandon a proposed project if it will have significant environmental impacts?
4. Given the abuses and misuses of SEQRA as illustrated in the Sandora case, which alternative environmental regulation regimes would you recommend?
5. Why is there a separate land use review process known as ULURP in addition to the extensive environmental review process? What triggers ULURP review?

**Important Dates**

Wednesday 10/12: Submit First Drafts of Paper by 9 a.m. (electronically via email to the professors and to Eliza)

**WEEK 8: Zoning, Inclusionary Zoning and Siting of Affordable Housing and Locally-Undesirable Land Uses (LULU’s)**

- Tuesday, October 18th
- **Topics:** Zoning and Rezoning as a Land Use Tool; Impact of Inclusionary Zoning Regimes; Siting of Affordable Housing, Homeless Shelters and Locally Undesirable Land Uses (LULU’s); Fair Share Criteria.
Readings


Discussion Questions
1. What is the geographical impact of rezoning over the last ten years in the development of housing and affordable housing?
2. What are the advantages and disadvantages of Inclusionary Zoning in creating affordable housing, especially the risks and opportunities of New York City’s mandatory IZ program?
3. How do you compare NYC’s “mandatory” IZ which only applies to new buildings in areas that have been upzoned to “mandatory” IZ in San Jose?
4. Did the plaintiffs in the ACORN case make any substantive claims or objections through the ULURP process that could not have been handled through the CEQR review?
5. By contrast, is the City’s process for siting a homeless shelter in the Ocean Hill case just a subterfuge to bypass the ULURP process in a low-income minority neighborhood?
6. Contrast the application of the Fair Share Criteria in the Ocean Hill and Queens Resident cases. Do you believe these cases were correctly decided?

WEEK 9: Economic and Community Development Policies and Strategies
- **Tuesday, October 25th**
- **Topics:** Attracting Economic Development Opportunities to Low-income and Minority Communities; Economic Development Strategies and the use of Incentives; Initiatives for Human Capital through Job Training and Workforce Development; Obstacles to Commercial and Retail Development.
Readings


Berrebi, Fisher & Quinn, “Community Economic Development Policy in the Aftermath of Amazon.”


(Optional) Brooklyn Community Board 14, “Job Training Programs” (June 2022) https://www.cb14brooklyn.com/community-directory/job-resources/job-training-programs/

Discussion Questions

1. What is meant by “economic development” and what goals would a City seek to achieve in having a policy to foster economic development in low-income communities?
2. Porter analyzes the obstacles to attracting new job-creating businesses into low-income neighborhoods and highlights the advantages which these communities should accentuate. Critique Porter’s advocacy of relying on the private sector to deliver economic development benefits. Contrast this to Carter’s approach of community self-empowerment.
3. What strategies and policies can a City use to foster economic development? What are the trade-offs between as-of-right versus discretionary incentives to attract economic development?
4. Which aspects of job training programs seem to be the most successful in improving life outcomes for low-income people?
5. What are the obstacles to attracting retail enterprises to underserved low-income neighborhoods?
WEEK 10: Approaches to Housing the Hardest to House

- Tuesday, November 1st
- **Topics:** Homelessness—Causes and Cures; Cost of Serving the Lowest Income Households; Tools for Serving These Households, including Public Housing and Section 8 Housing Choice Vouchers.

**Readings**

Coalition for the Homeless, *Basic Facts About Homelessness*:
https://www.coalitionforthehomeless.org/basic-facts-about-homelessness-new-york-city/


NYCHA Fact Sheet 2022:

NYU Furman Center Fact Brief, “How NYCHA Preserved Diversity in NY’s Changing Neighborhoods” (2019)

Victor Bach Testimony on PACT and RAD (2021)


**Discussion Questions**

1. Does permanent housing “solve” homelessness? Why or why not?
2. Currently, victims of domestic violence, intimidated witnesses and working families have priority for newly available NYCHA units and vouchers. Should homeless families and individuals have the highest priority for public housing and Housing Choice vouchers?
3. What role should residents play in NYCHA policy and implementation?
4. Does NYCHA serve as a conduit for neighborhood racial and economic segregation or integration?

**Important Dates**

Tuesday 11/08: No class election day
Friday 11/18: Field Trip (8:30am)

WEEK 11: Affordable Housing Case Study: Atlantic Yards

- Tuesday, November 15
Reading

This week the reading is a case study of the Atlantic Yards development, prepared for this class by a former student and available on Brightspace. The case study applies learnings from the entire semester, including

1. Identifying the community;
2. Considering the appropriate public intervention;
3. Weighing the costs and benefits of the project;
4. Analyzing how the project handled eminent domain, CEQR, ULURP, and zoning;
5. Identifying how the City and State coordinated their interventions at the site;
6. Analyzing how the court handled the voluminous litigation affecting the project; and
7. Analyzing the success of the project.

In order to guide your review of the case study, we have 18 questions about the case (see pages 45-47). We will assign each class member a question to answer as the lead, but everyone will be expected to contribute to the discussions.

Optional Reading


Important Dates

Tuesday 11/15: Papers for 11/22 presentations are due at 9 a.m. on 11/15. Submit electronically to all faculty and students.

Tuesday 11/22: Papers for 11/29 presentations are due at 9 a.m. on 11/22. Submit electronically to all faculty and students.

WEEKS 12 & 13: Student Presentation of Final Papers

- Tuesday, November 22 & 29