

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY
Robert F. Wagner Graduate School of Public Service
HPAM-GP.2852: Comparative Analysis of Health Systems

Spring, 2017
Tuesdays: 4:55PM-6:35PM
Bobst Library LL1.41
Office: Puck Bldg, 2nd fl. 295 Lafayette St., Rm. 3006
Admin. Assistant: Christopher Harris
christopher.harris@nyu.edu
(212) 998-7416

Prof. Victor G. Rodwin
victor.rodwin@nyu.edu

(212) 998-7459

COURSE DESCRIPTION

We tend to be ethnocentric in our views of health care organization and policy. A look abroad, however, can provide insights about problems at home. In spite of differences in the organization and financing of their health care systems, most countries share a number of common problems with the United States. First, is the question of deciding - or not explicitly deciding - what proportion of GNP should be devoted to health and welfare. Second, is the problem of agreeing on appropriate criteria to allocate health and social service expenditures. Third, is the problem of how to implement established policies: through regulation, promotion of competition, budgeting, or reimbursement incentives directed at health care providers.

The readings, lectures and class discussions will focus on the organization and financing of health systems in wealthy nations. We begin with a discussion of conventional health system models around the world and alternative perspectives for studying them and evaluating their performance. We will discuss how so much of the literature draws on selective evidence to evaluate health care systems in the U.S. and abroad. Finally, we will study a range of different approaches to the empirical analysis of health system performance in selected nations, and examine the extent to which the available evidence supports or refutes widely shared views of different health care systems.

LEARNING OBJECTIVES

- Analyze conceptual and methodological issues in the study of health systems
- Identify common problems and differences among diverse health systems
- Highlight key features of health systems in OECD nations and other countries.
- Assess the impact of globalization on health system development
- Analyze the U.S. health system from a comparative perspective
- Examine the uses of comparative analysis in learning from abroad

PREREQUISITES

Introduction to Health Policy and Management (P11.1830), Micro-Economics (P11.1018), Introduction to Public Policy (P11.1022).

REQUIRED BOOKS

- T.R. Reid, *The Healing of America: A Global Quest for Better, Cheaper and Fairer Health Care*. Penguin, 2010.

- Lynne Payer, *Medicine and Culture*. New York. Henry Holt, 1988.

Optional Book and Readings:

- T. Marmor, Freeman, R. and Okma, K. *Comparative Studies and the Politics of Modern Medical Care*. New Haven: YUP, 2009.

- OECD, Health Publications: <http://www.oecd.org/els/health-systems/health-publications.htm>

- Palley, H. ed. International Comparison of Some Healthcare Delivery Impacts on Vulnerable Populations. *Global Social Welfare* (3)3, 2016.

REQUIRED READINGS IN SYLLABUS ARE ALL POSTED ON NYU CLASSES

COURSE ASSIGNMENTS

There is neither a mid-term nor a final examination. I will ask you to compare two health care systems (one of which may be the U.S.); the other, preferably, one of the 11 wealthy nations for which the Commonwealth Fund has published survey data. The first class assignment (due Feb. 21st) focuses on assessing the performance of these health systems with respect to a range of indicators and survey data from Commonwealth Fund. The second assignment (due March 28th) focuses on extending this comparison by drawing on some OECD data (<http://www.oecd.org/health/health-data.htm>); and the cultural and institutional context of the same two health care systems you compared for the first assignment. Students with special interests in so-called BRIC nations (Brazil, Russian Federation, India and China) may complete their final research dossier (see below) on these countries but the two class exercises must focus on at least one of the 11 wealthy nations for which the Commonwealth Fund has published a wide range of survey data, and at least one nation for which the OECD has published data.

In addition to these two assignments (no longer than 3 pages, not including possible charts/tables), I will ask students to edit and improve their comparisons of the health care systems they have selected (based on the comments they have received) by submitting a final research dossier and making a 10 minute final presentation for the last class. The final research dossier should be posted on the NYU Classes site for this course. It should include the following components: 1) A bibliography of scholarly articles, as well as internet sites, blogs and newspaper articles about the health care systems in the nations you have compared; 2) Relevant charts and tables; 3) Your brief powerpoint presented to the class (no more than 10 slides); and 4) A two-page paper, beautifully written, summarizing what you learned from your research. The two-page paper should be followed by a section labeled “Appendix” which contains components (1), (2) and (3).

Guidelines for written assignments: All written assignments should be submitted in Times New Roman 12-point font, double-spaced, with one-inch page margins. Write in full paragraphs, in the first person, and active voice (see Strunk and White, *Elements of Style*, and buy yourself a copy as it will serve as the basic guide to good writing in this class). No lists (it’s boring!). No titles of books and full authors’ names in the text (use endnotes or footnotes or references for this). No Latin and bureaucratic writing (e.g. “as per your request”)! Use subheadings for clarity. Please use verbs, avoid gerunds and unnecessary adverbs (e.g. “interestingly”) and adjectives (like “very”). Be concise (when in doubt, strike it out!). Please review your short papers and rewrite them at least twice before posting for all of us to read. Please see NYU/Wagner’s resources for writing workshops and assistance: <http://wagner.nyu.edu/students/services/tutoring>. None of us can fail to benefit from such assistance!

Please submit written assignments directly to me in class (printed copies two sides to a page). In addition, submit a copy of all written assignments to the appropriate forums set up on NYU Classes for this course. There are three reasons for doing so. First, because the audience to whom you should address your papers is: the rest of us. Second, because the purpose of these assignments is to improve communication skills and to get to know one another. Third, because another purpose of these assignments is to convince the class of your point of view.

GRADING

The first two assignments will each count for 20% of the grade. The final research dossier will count for another 40% of the grade. Class participation will count for another 20% of the grade.

Plagiarism Policy: Academic integrity is crucial to the mission of NYU Wagner. Plagiarism of any form will not be tolerated since you have all signed an Academic Oath at NYU/Wagner and are bound by the academic code of the school. Please review the NYU policy on plagiarism (posted on NYU Classes) prior to submitting written work: <http://wagner.nyu.edu/students/policies>

CLASS CALENDAR

	Class	Topic
		INTRODUCTION
Jan 24	1	Course Overview
Jan 31	2	Health System Models in Theory and Practice: Which is the best?
Feb 7	3	Access, Rationing and Priority Setting in Health Systems
		COMPARISONS OF HEALTH SYSTEM PERFORMANCE
Feb 14	4	Cross-National Survey Data for Accessing Health Care Systems
Feb 21	5	Student Presentations on Selected Nations Surveyed by Commonwealth Fund
Feb 28	6	A World Health Organization (WHO) Perspective and its critics – Discrete Components of Performance vs. Composite Scores
Mar 7	7	Comparative Analyses Based on OECD Data, Institutional/Cultural Analysis
Mar 14		No Class
Mar 21		No Class
Mar 28	8	Student Presentations Based on OECD Data, Institutional/Cultural factors
Apr 4	9	A Cultural Approach to Comparative Health Systems Analysis
		NATIONAL EXCEPTIONALISM AND THE TEMPTATIONS OF LEARNING FROM ABROAD: CASE STUDIES
Apr 11	10	Methodological Issues
Apr 18	11	French National Health Insurance (NHI)
Apr 25	12	British National Health Service (NHS)
May 2	13	Final Presentations

OUTLINE OF COURSE TOPICS AND READINGS

I. INTRODUCTION

1. Course Overview, Jan. 24

Required Movie:

<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/frontline/film/sickaroundtheworld/>

Optional Reading for rest of class if relevant:

Palley, H. ed. International Comparison of Some Healthcare Delivery Impacts on Vulnerable Populations (available on NYU Classes).

2. Health System Models in Theory and Practice: Which is the Best? – Jan. 31

Required Reading:

T.R. Reid, *The Healing of America: A Global Quest for Better, Cheaper and Fairer Health Care*. Chapters 1-8.

Appleby, J. Which is the best health system in the world? *BMJ* (343), 2011.

Oliver, A. The folly of cross-country ranking exercises. *Health Economics, Policy and Law* (7) 2012.

Assignment: Come to class prepared to discuss: What are common challenges faced by health care systems discussed by T.R. Reid? What questions does T.R. Reid raise, which you would like to explore further?

3. Access, Rationing and Priority Setting in Health Systems, Feb. 7

Required Reading:

Machado, F. All in a day's work – Equity vs. equality at a public ICU in Brazil. *NEJM* (375) 25, 2016.

Chinitz, D. et al. Values, institutions and shifting paradigms: Expansion of the Israeli NHI basket of services. *Health Policy* (90) 2009.

Bevan, G. Brown. L. The political economy of rationing health care in England and the US: the 'accidental logics' of political settlements. *Health Economics, Policy and Law*. DOI: 10.1017/S174413114000127, 2014.

II. COMPARISONS OF HEALTH SYSTEM PERFORMANCE

4. Cross-National Survey Data for Assessing Health Care Systems, Feb. 14

Required Reading:

Schoen, C. et. al. A Survey of Primary Care Doctors in Ten Countries Shows Progress in Use of Health Information Technology, Less in Other Areas. *Health Affairs*, 2012.

C. Schoen et al. A Survey of Primary Care Physicians in Eleven Countries, 2009: Perspectives on Care, Costs and Experiences. *Health Affairs* Web Exclusive. DOI.10.1377, 2009.

Osborn, R. et al. International Survey of Older Adults Finds Shortcomings In Access, Coordination, And Patient-Centered Care, *Health Affairs* 33: 12, 2014.

Osborn, R. D. Moulds, E. C. Schneider et al. Primary Care Physicians in Ten Countries Report Challenges Caring for Patients with Complex Health Needs. *Health Affairs* 34(12), 2015.
http://www.commonwealthfund.org/~media/files/publications/in-the-literature/2015/dec/1849_osborn_primary_care_phys_10_countries_ha_12_2015_itl.pdf

Osborn, R. D. Squires, M. M. Doty, D. O. Sarnak, and E. C. Schneider. In New Survey of 11 Countries, U.S. Adults Still Struggle with Access to and Affordability of Health Care. *Health Affairs Web First*, 2016.
http://www.commonwealthfund.org/~media/files/publications/in-the-literature/2016/nov/1915_osborn_2016_intl_survey_ha_11_16_2016_itl_v2.pdf

5. Student Presentations on Selected Nations Surveyed by Commonwealth Fund, Feb.21

6. A World Health Organization (WHO) Perspective and its Critics -- Discrete Components of Performance vs. Composite Scores, February 28

Required Reading

World Health Organization, *The World Health Report 2000. Health System Performance* (Glance at report. It is downloadable from WHO at <http://whqlibdoc.who.int/publications/2003/9241562455.pdf>) and read the following article summary of conceptual framework in report).

Frenk, J and Murray, C. A Framework for Assessing the Performance of Health Systems. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 2000, 78 (6) 731

P. Musgrove. Judging Health Systems: Reflections on WHO's Methods. *Lancet* 361:1817-1820, 2003.

J. Coyne, P. Hilsenrath, V. Navarro. The World Health Report 2000: Can Health Care Systems Be Compared Using a Single Measure of Performance? *American Journal of Public Health* (92)1, 2002.

7. Comparative Analyses Based on OECD Health Data, March 7

Required Reading:

Review OECD Health Data: <http://www.oecd.org/health/health-data.htm>

Also review OECD publications relevant to your interests

U.E. Reinhardt, P.S. Hussey, and G. F. Anderson. U.S. Health Spending in an International Context. *Health Affairs* (23) 3, 2004.

G. Anderson, et. al. It's the Prices, Stupid: Why the United States is so Different from Other Countries. *Health Affairs* (23) 3, 2003.

J. Oberlander and J. White. Public Attitudes Toward Health Care Spending Aren't the Problem; Prices Are. *Health Affairs* (28)5, 2009.

SPRING RECESS: Monday, March 13; No Class on March 21

8. Student Presentations Based on OECD Data, Institutional/Cultural factors, March 28

9. A Cultural Approach to Comparative Health Systems Analysis, April 4

Required Reading:

Lynne Payer, *Medicine and Culture*. New York. Henry Holt, 1988.

III. NATIONAL EXCEPTIONALISM AND THE TEMPTATIONS OF LEARNING FROM ABROAD: CASE STUDIES

10. Methodological Issues, April 11

Required Reading:

L. Brown., "Comparing health systems in four countries: Lessons for the United States. *American J. of Public Health* (93), 2003.

Okma, K. G., & Marmor, T. R. (2013). Comparative studies and health care policy: Learning and mislearning across borders. *Clinical Medicine* 13(5), 487-491.

11. French National Health Insurance (NHI), April 18

Required Reading:

M. Steffen, The French Health Care System: Liberal Universalism. *JHPPL* (35)3, 2010.

V. Rodwin. The Health Care System Under French National Health Insurance: Lessons for Health Reform in the United States. *AJPH* (January, 2003)

V. Rodwin and C. Lepen. French Health Care Reform. *NEJM* (351)22, 2004.

12. British National Health Service (NHS), April 25

Required Reading:

R. Klein. The Troubled Transformation of Britain's National Health Service. *NEJM* (355) 4:409-15, 2006.

13. Final Presentations, May 2

