



NYU

**ROBERT F. WAGNER GRADUATE
SCHOOL OF PUBLIC SERVICE**

HPAM-GP 2852

Comparative Analysis of Health Systems

Fall 2018

Fall 2018

Tuesdays: 6:45PM-8:25PM

Room: L114, 12 Waverly Pl.

Office: Puck Bldg, 2nd fl. 295 Lafayette St., Rm. 3006

Prof. Victor G. Rodwin, victor.rodwin@nyu.edu, (212) 998-7459

Admin. Assistant: Christopher Harris, christopher.harris@nyu.edu, (212) 998-7416

Course Description

We tend to be ethnocentric in our views of health care organization and policy. A look abroad, however, can provide insights about problems at home. In spite of differences in the organization and financing of their health care systems, most countries share a number of common problems with the United States. First, is the question of deciding - or not explicitly deciding - what proportion of GNP should be devoted to health and welfare. Second, is the problem of agreeing on appropriate criteria to allocate health and social service expenditures. Third, is the problem of how to implement established policies: through regulation, promotion of competition, budgeting, or reimbursement incentives directed at health care providers.

The readings, lectures and class discussions will focus on the organization, financing and performance of health systems in wealthy nations. We begin with a discussion of conventional health system models around the world and alternative perspectives for studying them and evaluating their performance. We will discuss how so much of the literature draws on selective evidence to evaluate health care systems in the U.S. and abroad. Finally, we will study a range of different approaches to the empirical analysis of health system performance in selected nations, and examine the extent to which the available evidence supports or refutes widely shared views of different health care systems.

Required Books

1. Reid, TR. *The Healing of America: A Global Quest for Better, Cheaper and Fairer Health Care*. Penguin, 2010.
2. Britnell, M. *In Search of the Perfect Health System*. Palgrave, 2015.

ADDITIONAL READINGS IN SYLLABUS ARE ALL POSTED ON NYU CLASSES

Optional Book

1. T. Marmor, Freeman, R. and Okma, K. *Comparative Studies and the Politics of Modern Medical Care*. New Haven, YUP, 2009.

Course Learning Objectives

- Analyze conceptual and methodological issues in the study of health systems
- Identify common problems and differences among diverse health systems
- Highlight key features of health systems in OECD nations and other countries.
- Assess the impact of globalization on health system development
- Analyze the U.S. health system from a comparative perspective
- Examine the uses of comparative analysis in learning from abroad
- Present an argument, based on relevant concepts and evidence

Learning Assessment Table

Program Competency	Corresponding Course Learning Objective	Corresponding Assignments	Level of Competency Expected to Be Achieved via the Assignment (Basic = 1, Intermediate = 2, Advanced = 3)
Use evidence-based practices to improve health system performance, including efficiency, quality of care, patient engagement, and equitable access to services	Examine the uses of comparative analysis in learning from abroad Analyze U.S. health system from a comparative perspective	Position papers Research dossier	3 - Advanced
The ability to present convincingly to individuals and groups the evidence to support a point of view, position or recommendation	Present an argument, based on relevant concepts and evidence	Final Individual Presentation	2 – Intermediate

Class Calendar

Introduction

Date	Class	Topic
Sept 4	1	Overview of the Field: Comparative Health Systems
Sept 11	2	T.R. Reid's Global Quest for Better, Cheaper and Fairer Health Care
Sept 18	3	Britnell's Search for the Perfect Health System

Comparative Analysis of Health Systems

Date	Class	Topic
Sept 25	4	OECD: Spending, Resources and Outcomes
Oct 2	5	Health System Metrics: A Review of Comparative Performance Literature (I)
Oct 9		No Class
Oct 16	6	Health System Metrics: A Review of Comparative Performance Literature (II)
Oct 23	7	What's the Best Health Care System and How Would You Know?
Sept 25	4	OECD: Spending, Resources and Outcomes

National Exceptionalism and the Temptations of Learning from Abroad: Case Studies

Date	Class	Topic
Oct 30	8	Methodological Issues
Nov 6	9	Social Insurance: France, Germany and Japan
Nov 13	10	The English National Health Service
Nov 20	11	Canada
Nov 27	12	China and India
Dec 4	13	Cuba and Brazil
Dec 11	14	Final Presentations

Course Assignments

There is neither a mid-term nor a final examination. I will ask students to complete very short assignments before coming to most classes because the quality of our discussions depends, in part, on the extent to which students come to class prepared! The final assignment involves conducting research on one of the health systems covered in the class. There is no time for a final paper. Rather, this assignment calls for digging deeper into the recent evolution and performance of a health care system and how it compares to that of another nation. The output for this assignment should be delivered in two parts. The first part is due for session #8 and involves a two-page paper defining a research project and assembling a research dossier with all necessary materials to answer the questions posed. Both parts of this assignment must be posted on the appropriate forums of the NYU Classes site for this course.

Grading

Each part of the main assignment (the research dossier) will count for 25% of the grade. The very short weekly assignments, based on your reactions to the readings, should be posted on the appropriate class forums and will count for 40% of the grade. Class participation will count for another 10% of the grade.

Plagiarism Policy: Academic integrity is crucial to the mission of NYU Wagner. Plagiarism of any form will not be tolerated since you have all signed an Academic Oath at NYU/Wagner and are bound by the academic code of the school. Please review the [NYU policy on plagiarism](#) (posted on Wagner Website) prior to submitting written work:

Outline of Course Topics and Readings

I. Introduction

1. **Overview of the Field: Comparative Health Systems**, Sept. 4
Required Movie: [Front Line: Sick Around America](#)
Please come to class prepared to discuss: What are common challenges faced by health care systems discussed by T.R. Reid? What questions does T.R. Reid raise, which you would like to explore further?
2. **TR Reid's Global Quest for Better, Cheaper and Fairer Health Care**, Sept. 11
Required Reading:
T.R. Reid, *The Healing of America: A Global Quest for Better, Cheaper and Fairer Health Care*, 2009. Chapters 1-8.
3. **Britnell's Search for the Perfect Health Systems**, Sept 18
Required Reading:
Britnell, M. *In Search for the Perfect Health System*, 2015.

II. Comparative Analysis of Health Systems

4. **OECD: Spending and Resources**, Sept. 25
Required Reading:
Papanicolas, I. Woskie, L. Jha, A. Health care spending in the United States and other high-income countries. *JAMA* 319 (10), 2018.

Optional Readings:
U.E. Reinhardt, P.S. Hussey, and G. F. Anderson. U.S. Health Spending in an International Context. *Health Affairs* (23) 3, 2004.

G. Anderson, et. al. It's the Prices, Stupid: Why the United States is so Different from Other Countries. *Health Affairs* (23) 3, 2003.

J. Oberlander and J. White. Public Attitudes Toward Health Care Spending Aren't the Problem; Prices Are. *Health Affairs* (28)5, 2009.

5. **Health System Metrics: A Review of Comparative Performance Literature (I)**, Oct. 2
Part I. The World Health Organization and its Critics: Discrete components of performance vs. composite scores/rankings

Required Reading:

World Health Organization, *The World Health Report 2000. Health System Performance* (Glance at report. It is downloadable from WHO [here](#)) and read the following article summary of conceptual framework in report).

Frenk, J and Murray, C. (2000). A Framework for Assessing the Performance of Health Systems. *Bulletin of the World Health Organization*, 78(6), 717-31.

P. Musgrove. (2003). Judging Health Systems: Reflections on WHO's Methods. *Lancet* 361(9371), 1817-1820.

Coyne, J. and Hilsenrath, P. (2002). "The World Health Report 2000: Can Health Care Systems Be Compared Using a Single Measure of Performance?" *American Journal of Public Health* 92(1), 30.

Navarro, Vicente. (2002). "The World Health Report 2000: Can Health Care Systems Be Compared Using a Single Measure of Performance?" *American Journal of Public Health* 92(1), 31.

6. **Health System Metrics: A Review of Comparative Performance Literature (II)**, Oct. 16
Part II. The continuing contributions of the Commonwealth Fund

Required Reading:

R. Osborn, D. Squires, M. M. Doty, D. O. Sarnak, and E. C. Schneider, "In New Survey of 11 Countries, U.S. Adults Still Struggle with Access to and Affordability of Health Care," *Health Affairs Web First*, 2016.

Schneider, E. (2017). From last to first – Could the U.S. health care system become the best in the world? *NEJM* 377, 901-904.

Optional Reading:

Schneider et al. (2017). *Mirror, Mirror: International Comparison Reflects flaws and opportunities for better U.S. health care*. New York, the Commonwealth Fund.

7. **What's the Best Health Care System and How Would You Know?** Oct. 23

Required Reading:

Appleby, J. (2011). Which is the best health system in the world? *BMJ* 343, 722-723.

Oliver, A. (2012). The folly of cross-country ranking exercises. *JHPEL*. 7(1), 15-17.

III. National Exceptionalism and the Temptations of Learning from Abroad: Case Studies

8. **Methodological Issues**, Oct. 30

Required Reading:

L. Brown. Comparing health systems in four countries: Lessons for the United States. (2003). *American J. of Public Health* 93(1), 52-56.

Okma, KG. & Marmor, TR. (2013). Comparative studies and health care policy: Learning and mislearning across borders. *Clinical Medicine* 13(5), 487-491

9. **Social Insurance: France, Germany and Japan**, Nov. 6

Required Reading:

M. Steffen. (2010). Social Health Insurance Systems: What Makes the Difference? The Bismarkian Case in France and Germany. *The Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis*. 12(1-2), 141-161.

Rodwin VG. (2018). The French health care system. *World Hospitals and Health Services*. 54(1), 49-55.

Nay, O. et al. (2016). Achieving universal health coverage in France: policy reforms and the challenge of inequalities. *Lancet* 387(10034), 2236-49.

Ikegami, N. Ch. 1 in his [Universal Health Coverage for Inclusive and Sustainable Development: Lessons from Japan. 2014.](#)

10. **The English National Health Service (NHS)**, Nov. 13

Required Reading:

Appleby, J. (2018). The NHS at 70. Loved, Valued, Affordable. *BMJ*. 361.

Klein, R. (2018). The National Health Service (NHS) at 70: Bevan's Double-Edged Legacy. *Health Economics, Policy and Law*. Jan 8, 1-10.

11. **Canada (Quebec)**, Nov. 20

Required Reading:

S. Lewis. A System in Name Only – Access, Variation and Reform in Canada’s Provinces. NEJM. 372(6), 497-500.

M. Gusmano, VG. Rodwin, E. Strumph. (2018). Comparative Analysis of Health System Performance in Montreal and New York: The Importance of Context for Interpreting Indicators.” Journal of Health Economics, Policy and Law.

12. **China and India**, Nov. 27

Required Reading:

He, A. Meng, Q. (2015). An interim interdisciplinary evaluation of China’s national health care reform: emerging evidence and new perspectives. Journal of Asian Public Policy, 8(1),1-8.

Reddy, KS. (2018). Health Care Reforms in India. JAMA. 319(24), 2477-2478.

Reddy, KS. (2015). India’s Aspirations for Universal Health Coverage. NEJM 373, 1-5.

Qadeer, I. (2013). Universal Health Care: the Trojan Horse of Neoliberal Policies. Social Change. 43(2), 149-164.

13. **Cuba**, Dec. 4

Required Readings:

[Cuba’s International Health Brigades](#)

Keck, CW. Reed, GA. (2012). The curious case of Cuba. AJPH.102(8), 13-22.

Werlau, M. (2013). Cuba’s Health Care Diplomacy: The Business of Humanitarianism. World Affairs.

De Vos, P, et al. (2007). Cuba’s International Cooperation in Health: an Overview. International J. of Health Services. 37(4), 761-776.

14. **Final Presentations**, Dec. 11