Immigration Politics and Policy—
Past and Present
PADM-GP 2213
Spring 2021

Class location and time:
Tuesdays 4:55-6:35
Zoom

Natasha Iskander
Associate Professor of Public Policy
NYU Wagner
Puck Building, rm 3043
natasha.iskander@nyu.edu

Office hours: by appointment

Course description:
The politics of immigration and immigration policy seem more critical now than ever. Public debates about immigration have roiled nations around the world, and disagreements about how immigration should be regulated, who should have the right to migrate, what political rights immigrants should have once they cross a border, and how immigrants should participate in the economy have strained political alliances and upended norms of political discourse. In some cases, conflicts over immigration debates have been used to justify the overhaul of political institutions. However, these are not new. The history of migration is long, and the disputes about migration just as old. In the modern era – defined here as the mid-19th century onward – debates about migration have returned over and over to a consistent set of themes, and have often been as heated and as strident as they are today.

These debates have engaged head-on with issues of economic equity and distribution of wealth, national identity, and the allocation of power in a society. Their connection to the
actual empirics of migration, however, has been more tenuous. While the political discourse is framed in terms of immigration policy, the political contests have had more to do with tensions around economic transformation and dislocation, with concerns about national security, and with changes in social norms than they have had to do with the actual observed facts of immigration. Despite this slippage, these debates have had stakes that are very high. The policies they have produced have affected migrants profoundly, often upending their social and economic lives.

The course considers these debates, their relationship to the empirics of migration, and the policy outcomes that they produce. But this course is not about immigrants. While this course considers the strategies that immigrants and their communities have developed to cope with effects of immigrant policy, it is not a social and political history of immigrants. It looks at the policies that define who is immigrant, the policies that shape the conditions under which people cross borders, and the policies that define the constraints that they face. It examines the history of specific policies and administrative practices, and traces the politics that have honed them and contested them over time. This course starts from the premise that immigrant policy is never primarily about immigrants at all, but rather about the politics of defining nationhood, sovereignty, labor rights, state latitude in policing and control, and the welfare responsibilities of the state.

To explore the stakes and political processes involved in immigration processes, the course focus in its Spring 2021 cycle on immigration policy in the United States. The reason for this is two-fold. First, the Trump administration was exceptionally active in changing immigration policy and imposing new immigration restriction. Most of these changes were administrative, not legislative, but their reach and impact has been significant. The Biden administration is likely to engage a similar active process of administrative policy making in immigration, although its priorities are likely to be meaningfully different that those of the previous administration, which prioritized limiting immigration. Second, the policies that the United States has developed has served as template for other countries around the world. Sometimes, this replication occurs through a form of political isomorphism and shift in global discourse around the rights of migrants. But the replication of U.S. immigration policy models has also occurred by fiat, with the United States imposing systems of border control on other countries, directly or by making trade and aid conditional on the adoption of immigration controls.

This course will look at the politics and processes of immigration policy in the United States from four angles: 1) the construction and militarization of borders, and their relationship to the politics of national identity; 2) the management of labor and the stratification of the labor market; 3) the development of carceral infrastructures to enforce migration and their relationship to a broader reliance on carceral strategies to segment space and to racialize freedom of movement; and 4) the relationship between the definition of asylum policies and the construction of the social safety net. For each of these topics, the course reaches back to find their historical expressions, and brings the insights and questions from the past to bear on the present.
Course objectives:

1. To provide an overview of the central theoretical debates in the study of international migration, with a focus on how theoretical frameworks used to explain labor migration, the distinction between political and economic migration, and the relationship between economies that migration can foster shape policy.

2. To provide a historical referent for contemporary migration policies, for current debates around migration, and for new policy proposals for migration management.

3. To analyze the effects of immigration policy, on immigrant and non-immigrant populations

4. To understand the function of immigration policy as a policy arena for the development of policy instruments applied to domains that do not pertain directly to immigration control or management

5. To consider how immigration policy stratifies labor markets, spaces, and polities by race and gender

6. To consider emergent trends in migration, and to tease out what aspects are novel and require new policy approaches, and which carry echoes from previous policy experiences.

7. To understand the administrative apparatus for the implementation and enforcement of immigration policy and to identify administrative levers for policy change, policy retraction, and policy redesign.

8. To learn how to prepare a cogent analysis of policy and a clear concise argument for policy change – policy brief

Course requirements, assignments, and grading:

This class is organized as a seminar, and investment in the readings is critical to the process of reaction and interpretation in which we will be engaging. Completion of the readings is a basic requirement for the course. The emphasis on books is purposeful; books allow for greater detail and can often provide more nuance than an article, which is often constrained by limits on length. Policy debates about immigration tend to rely on stereotypes, political sloganeering, and platitudes, and more than in most arenas of policy-making, policy debates and policy measures do not invoke empirics or detail. The book-based approach used in this course is designed as an intervention to highlight the distance between empirics and policy debates in immigration policy. The requirement for the course is that you invest in each text fully, but you are encouraged to read strategically. There may be sections of the book assigned that may be more compelling to you, and other sections that you may want to review with a lighter touch.

Most weeks, we will consider a policy instrument or measure – or set of policies and administrative measures – that grow out of the policy-making histories and dynamics covered in the book assigned. Most of these policies will have been recently implemented, generally under the Trump administration. We will consider the ways in which they are an extension of
past practice and the ways in which they represent a break. We will explore the effect of those policies on immigrant and non-immigrant populations in the United States and beyond.

Additionally, articles or video clips covering current events related to the migration issues covered each week will be recommended. There are under the “trending” section in the readings. The goal is to connect the analysis of migration themes to debates about migration happening currently in the political sphere – and specifically to moves by the incoming administration to change aspects of immigration policy.

The instructor will populate this section, but the trending section is also a space for crowdsourcing. Students are encouraged to suggest and share articles from the press on the themes covered each week.

You should plan to spend at least four-to-five hours a week on readings for the course. Once you have completed the readings, please take 15-30 minutes to write down the main themes of the readings, to note the facets of the reading you found compelling or objectionable, or perhaps even moved you, and to flag elements of the reading you would like to know more about. Please flag the central question this reading raised for you and post it to the “pressing questions” forum on NYU classes before our class meeting. You can keep these notes for yourself, but you are also invited to share these reactions on the class forum, on NYU Classes.

Class participation is a central requirement of the course. Participation means sharing your reflections in class. Listening carefully is an important form of participation. Please be attuned to the quality of your engagement and of your attention to the readings and to the commentary offered by your colleagues. Quality matters as much as quantity. Because the readings are required, I may, at any time, call on students to summarize or react to the readings.

In addition to sharing your reactions and insights in class, you are encouraged to post to the class forum on NYU classes. You may share news items with your colleagues, research papers, video clips and links to short documentaries, as well information about public events at NYU and around NYC. You are also encouraged to share your thoughts and comments on the readings, your reaction to your colleagues’ reflection essays and discussion guides (see below), and your personal impressions of political events.

Class participation is critical to the pedagogical process around which the course is organized and it will be factored into your final grade.

Class participation is worth 20 percent of your final grade.

You are also required to prepare four written assignments: two policy reflections, one policy brief, and one personal reflection essay.

Policy reflection: 800-1000 words – public – posted to NYU Classes site. You are required to write a policy reflection memo. Begin with policy measure and consider how it relates to the historical or empirical study considered in any of the weeks prior to Week 10. You may draw from one week’s case or from multiple weeks. How it the policy tool an extension of
past practice? In what ways does it differ? What does considering the policy measure in a larger empirical/historical context reveal about what the measure is meant to achieve? How does this goal relate to its impact? Does analyzing this policy tool in a broader context change your assessment of it? If yes, why? What surprises you about the policy tool and its history? While it may be useful to provide a brief overview of the policy tool and of the historical/empirical context laid out in the book you are considering, please be sure to reserve room for your own reflections.

**Policy brief exercise:** this is a three-part assignment.

1. **Short abstract:** individual – one page. Please select a policy instrument that you are interested in considering. Please draft a one-page abstract in which you address three questions:
   a. What is the policy measure that you want to analyze? Identify and describe – about 1 paragraph
   b. Why is this policy measure significant? Explain why you would like to consider this policy measure
   c. What consequences or impacts of this policy concern you most?
   This abstract will be the basis on which you will form teams for the rest of the assignment – either self-organized or organized by the instructor.  
   *Due Week 3 by class time*

2. **Policy brief:** This assignment will be done in teams of 4 students. (Please select your team by Week 4, or you will assigned by the professor.) 3,500 words + appendix if desired (up to 3,000 words) – public – posted to NYU Classes site. In this memo, you will complete an analysis of a policy measure and its impacts, and you will recommend what changes to that policy you deem appropriate. In outlining suggested changes, you will need to make a case for why those changes are indicated and what administrative, legal, legislative, or political avenue(s) you recommend for making those changes. The memo should include the four sections outlined below. Please write clearly and concisely – imagine that you are writing a background document that a legislator, community groups, or an advocacy organization could use.
   a. Description of policy measure
   b. Historical background or empirical context of policy measure
   c. Impact of policy measure on immigrant and non-immigrant populations (you do not necessarily need to distinguish between these two groups)
   d. Recommendations for policy change

3. **Presentation of policy brief:** in teams. 10-15 minute in-class presentation of policy brief. In this presentation, you will focus on making a case for why this policy should be changed, and on why the changes you are recommending are the most appropriate.
   *The policy brief and presentation are both due Week 13 by class time.*

**Personal reflection essay:** individual – 800-1,000 words – private – submitted by email to the instructor. Please reflect on a theme, political dynamic, or historical pattern we covered in the course. What surprised you about it? What moved you about it? How did your perspective on it change? How did it connect to your personal experience?

Write carefully, clearly, and thoughtfully. Please remember to support your statements with evidence, and to cite your sources appropriately.
The policy reflections are each worth 15 percent of your final grade, the policy brief assignment is worth 35 percent of your final grade, and the personal reflection essay is worth 15 percent of your final grade.

Course schedule:

Week 1 – Tuesday February 2
Week 2 – Tuesday February 9
Week 3 – Tuesday February 16
Week 4 – Tuesday February 24
Week 5 – Tuesday March 2
Week 6 – Tuesday March 9
Week 7 – Tuesday March 16
Week 8 – Tuesday March 23
Week 9 – Tuesday April 6
Week 10 – Tuesday April 13
Week 11 – Tuesday April 20
Week 12 – Friday April 23 4pm
Week 13 – Tuesday April 27
Week 14 – Tuesday May 4

Assignment summary table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment</th>
<th>Summary</th>
<th>Weighting</th>
<th>Due date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Class Participation</td>
<td>• Thoughtful commentary</td>
<td>20% of final grade</td>
<td>Throughout course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment #1</td>
<td>• Policy Reflection</td>
<td>15% of final grade</td>
<td>Week 5 or 7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment #2</td>
<td>• Policy Reflection</td>
<td>25% of final grade</td>
<td>Week 7 or 10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment #3</td>
<td>• Abstract</td>
<td>40% of final grade</td>
<td>Week 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Policy Memo + Presentation</td>
<td></td>
<td>Week 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assignment #4</td>
<td>• Reflection Essay</td>
<td>15% of final grade</td>
<td>May 11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Learning Assessment Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment</th>
<th>Learning Objective Covered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Participation + completion of readings</td>
<td>All</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy reflection memos</td>
<td>1-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy brief</td>
<td>3-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy brief presentation</td>
<td>All, but especially 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal reflection memo</td>
<td>2-6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Letter Grades

Letter grades for the entire course will be assigned as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Letter Grade</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>4.0 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-</td>
<td>3.7 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B+</td>
<td>3.3 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>3.0 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-</td>
<td>2.7 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C+</td>
<td>2.3 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>2.0 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-</td>
<td>1.7 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>0.0 points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Student grades will be assigned according to the following criteria:
• (A) Excellent: Exceptional work for a graduate student. Work at this level is unusually thorough, well-reasoned, creative, methodologically sophisticated, and well written. Work is of exceptional, professional quality.

• (A-) Very good: Very strong work for a graduate student. Work at this level shows signs of creativity, is thorough and well-reasoned, indicates strong understanding of appropriate methodological or analytical approaches, and meets professional standards.

• (B+) Good: Sound work for a graduate student; well-reasoned and thorough, methodologically sound. This is the graduate student grade that indicates the student has fully accomplished the basic objectives of the course.

• (B) Adequate: Competent work for a graduate student even though some weaknesses are evident. Demonstrates competency in the key course objectives but shows some indication that understanding of some important issues is less than complete. Methodological or analytical approaches used are adequate but student has not been thorough or has shown other weaknesses or limitations.

• (B-) Borderline: Weak work for a graduate student; meets the minimal expectations for a graduate student in the course. Understanding of salient issues is somewhat incomplete. Methodological or analytical work performed in the course is minimally adequate. Overall performance, if consistent in graduate courses, would not suffice to sustain graduate status in “good standing.”

• (C/-/+ Deficient: Inadequate work for a graduate student; does not meet the minimal expectations for a graduate student in the course. Work is inadequately developed or flawed by numerous errors and misunderstanding of important issues. Methodological or analytical work performed is weak and fails to demonstrate knowledge or technical competence expected of graduate students.

• (F) Fail: Work fails to meet even minimal expectations for course credit for a graduate student. Performance has been consistently weak in methodology and understanding, with serious limits in many areas. Weaknesses or limits are pervasive.

Class Policies

Academic Integrity
Academic integrity is a vital component of Wagner and NYU. All students enrolled in this class are required to read and abide by Wagner’s Academic Code. All Wagner students have already read and signed the Wagner Academic Oath. Plagiarism of any form will not be tolerated and students in this class are expected to report violations to me. If any student in this class is
unsure about what is expected of you and how to abide by the academic code, you should consult with me.

**Zoom Etiquette**
You are expected to participate in each class with your Zoom audio and video on. Please review Wagner’s [Zoom in the Classroom](https://wagner.nyu.edu/portal/students/academics/advisement/writing-center) series about classroom etiquette, participation, and more.

Students may not share the Zoom classroom recordings. The recordings are kept within the NYU Classes site and are for students enrolled in this course only.

**Absences**
If you will be absent to class or will arrive more than 15 minutes late to the zoom call, please email the professor. Accumulated absences may affect your participation grade.

NYU’s Calendar Policy on Religious Holidays
[NYU’s Calendar Policy on Religious Holidays](https://library.nyu.edu/people/andrew-battista/) states that members of any religious group may, without penalty, absent themselves from classes when required in compliance with their religious obligations. Please notify me in advance of religious holidays that might coincide with exams to schedule mutually acceptable alternatives.

**The Wagner Writing Center**
One important skill this class seeks to cultivate is the clear and grounded articulation of ideas about development. If you would like additional support with the craft of writing, Wagner tutors are available to help students with their writing skills. Please see details at [https://wagner.nyu.edu/portal/students/academics/advisement/writing-center](https://wagner.nyu.edu/portal/students/academics/advisement/writing-center). This webpage has additional details on other useful resources, including NYU Writing Center and several links concerning plagiarism and how to cite properly.

The Wagner Writing Center offers: 1) excellent free skills-based non-credit workshops on writing, research, citations; 2) one-off lectures, co-curricular modules, online webinars and how-to guides; and 3) one-on-one coaching to help students throughout their writing process from idea generation, to outlining, forming effective arguments, and final draft polish. They do not edit. They coach. The Writing Center’s goal is to help students improve writing overall.

**Research support**
The semester-long research assignment requires research beyond the readings assigned for the course. The NYU library system provides additional support for research using many different kinds of data. For more information about these services, now offered remotely, please go to the guides link at Bobst library. Additionally, you may contact Andrew Battista, Research Librarian for Public Policy and Urban Planning at Bobst [https://library.nyu.edu/people/andrew-battista/](https://library.nyu.edu/people/andrew-battista/).

**Technology Support**
You have 24/7 support via NYU’s IT services. Explore the [NYU servicelink knowledgebase](https://library.nyu.edu/people/andrew-battista/) for troubleshooting and student guides for all NYU-supported tools (NYU Classes, Zoom, etc). Contact askIT@nyu.edu or 1-212-998-3333 (24/7) for technology assistance, or contact [Zoom’s 24/7 technical support](https://library.nyu.edu/people/andrew-battista/) (includes a chat function), or review [Zoom’s support resources](https://library.nyu.edu/people/andrew-battista/). Your peers are another source of support, so you could ask a friend or classmate for help or tips.
If you do not have the appropriate hardware technology nor financial resources to purchase the technology, consider applying for the NYU Emergency Relief Grant.

*Henry and Lucy Moses Center for Students with Disabilities at NYU*

Academic accommodations are available for students with disabilities. Please visit the Moses Center for Students with Disabilities (CSD) website and click on the Reasonable Accommodations and How to Register tab or call or email CSD at (212-998-4980 or mosescsd@nyu.edu) for information. Students who are requesting academic accommodations are strongly advised to reach out to the Moses Center as early as possible in the semester for assistance.

*Classroom Etiquette:*

It is crucial that the tone of exchange of ideas and impressions, in class discussion as well as outside the classroom in conversations on the class forum, remain respectful, constructive, and inclusive at all times. This norm will be strenuously enforced, and anyone who violates this norm will be asked to leave the conversation, regardless of whether that conversation is in zoom classroom meeting or in asynchronous formats online.

*Readings for the course – where to find them:*

**Books:** This course is organized around books purposefully. Book-length narratives provide the complexity and nuance that will allow us to get beyond convention wisdom and broad political statements about migration. Most of the books for this course are available on-line through the NYU library. Unfortunately, due to COVID restrictions, I am unable to put the books on reserve at Bobst library. In lieu of this, selections for the books that are unavailable online will be posted on the NYU classes site for the course, and purchasing options for those books are provided. Please see the information about where to find the books below.

**Articles:** If a link to the article is not provided in the syllabus, the articles can be found on NYU Classes, in the “Resources” folder.

**Policy measures:** the source for brief descriptions of the policy measures we will consider will be indicated on the syllabus

**Trending articles/videos/op-eds:** these will be posted to the forum section of NYU Classes one week before they are due.

The readings under the *trending* section are be newspaper articles or video clips covering current events related to the migration issues covered each week. The goal is to connect the
analysis of migration themes to debates about migration happening currently in the political sphere.

The instructor will populate this section, but the trending section is also a space for crowdsourcing. Students are encouraged to suggest and share articles from the press on the themes covered each week.

Books-- where to find them:


Course outline:

1. Introduction: Immigration Policy Past and Present

Week 1—

How migration policy affects lives, loves, and families: The consequences and logic of immigration controls

What are the main concerns that have driven migration and migration policy over the past century?

Readings due:


Trending—


Week 2—

The bureaucratic border: The immigration restrictions implemented under the Trump administration

How have the administrative and policy changes implemented during the Trump presidency the US immigration system? Which policies represent a break from past practice and which policies are a continuation?

Readings due:


Trending—

Week 3—

**Immigration policy design and implementation: the U.S. political structure and process**

What are the roles of different branches of government in making immigration policy? How has immigration policy shaped the powers of different branches of government? What does this mean for the design, implementation, and retraction of immigration policy measures?

*Readings due:*

*Trending—*
TBA

*Policy abstract due*

2. **Borders**

Week 4—

**The construction of the nation through the invention of the frontier: Race, immigration, and economic extraction in the United States**

What is the role of state and non-state violence in the invention and construction of the US border? Is the construction of the US border a form of US exceptionalism, or do all borders reflect nationalist and racial violence in their construction?

*Readings due:*

*Policy:*
- Construction of barriers along the southern border – see MPI p. 32

*Trending—*
TBA

Week 5—

**Selective exclusion and security concerns**
What are the justifications used to exclude certain groups of immigrants and what are the criteria used to determine exclusion (race, religion, class)? To what extent does the implementation of exclusionary immigration policies foster the development of bureaucracies and policies design to surveil and control residents, citizens and non-citizens alike?

*Readings due:*  

*Policy:*  
- Travel bans – MPI p.9  

*Trending~*  

### 3. Labor

Week 6—

**Immigration controls, skill stratification, and the question of deservingness**

How does immigration policy stratify the labor market? How do enforcement practices shape workplace conditions? How does immigration policy shape the definition and valuation of skill?

*Readings due:*  


*Policy:*  
- Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals – National Immigration Law Center brief: [https://www.nilc.org/issues/daca/](https://www.nilc.org/issues/daca/)

*Trending~*  
TBA

### 4. Interlude
Week 7—

**Cruelty as citizenship**

Guest Speaker: Cristina Beltrán, NYU

**Readings due:**


Week 8—

**Nativism and sanctuary across the political divide**

Guest Speaker: Paula Chakravartty, NYU

**Readings due:**

Karma R Chávez, “Coming Out as aCoalitional Gesture” in *Queer Migration Politics: Activist Rhetoric and Coalitional Possibilities*


OPTIONAL: WATCH: Cristina Ibarra and Alex Rivera, *The Infiltrators*. https://theinfiltrators.oscilloscope.net/

5. Detention, Deportation, and Control

Week 9— (April 6)

**Immigration, immigrant workers, and worker rights**

Guest Speaker: Janice Fine, Rutgers University

**Readings due:**

○ TBA

Week 10— (April 13)

**Detention and carceral strategies of immigration control**
How did the carceral system of immigration control emerge in the United States? What was the process of administrative experimentation with carceral technologies?

**Readings due:**

**Policy:**
- Narrowed access to counsel and weakened protections for children in immigration court – MPI p. 56-59

**Trending**
TBA

### 6. What is old is new again

**Week 11— (April 20)**

**Migration and climate change**

How are emergent climate change pressures creating new waves of migration? How are the pressures refracted through institutional structures, and does this matter for their effect on migration dynamics? Are these pressures new?

**Readings due:**

**Policy:**
- Changes to asylum policy and restrictions on qualifications – MPI p. 68-76
- “Remain in Mexico” (Migrant Protection Protocols) – MPI p. 27-28

**Trending**
TBA

**Week 12— (April 23)**

**Covid and migration restrictions**

**Readings due:**
Policy:
- Please review Trump administration Covid-related migration restrictions – MPI p. 7-23

Trending:
TBA

7. The Way Forward

Week 13—(April 27)

Reflections and Synthesis

Is everything old new again? What are the enduring patterns of immigration policy making and enforcement in the United States? What are the possibilities for policy change? What are the implications for global migration policy making?

Week 14—(May 4)

Student team policy brief presentations